

### 8th BESTUFS Workshop

#### “Public Private Partnership (PPP) enhancing urban goods transport”

12<sup>th</sup> & 13<sup>th</sup> of September 2002, NH Hotel,  
Malaga, Spain

#### Participants of the workshop

Company Name	Name	e-mail address
University of Westminster	Mr S. Anderson	S.M.Anderson@westminster.ac.uk
CSST Torino	Mr C. Aicardi	Csstto@its.it
Proyectos de Ingeniera Y Calidat S.L.	Mr A. Ben Abdelouahab	Abdelouahab@proinca.com
INECO	Mr J. Bermejo Lopez	Jbermejo@ineco.es
PSD	Mr R. Van Bockel	Psd@psd-online.nl
Chamber of Commerce	Mr F. Broersma	Fbroersma@ groningen.kvk.nl
ISIS	Mrs R. Castellani	
Consulting Chraïbi	Mr M. Chraïbi	-
GART	Mrs L. Dablanc	laetitia.dablanc@gart.org
ECONSULT	Mr R. Dorner	r.dorner@econsult.co.at
RAPP AG Ingenieure + Planer	Mr D. Egger	dieter.egger@rapp.ch
INECO	Mr C. Garcia Carcelles	Cgarcia@ineco.es
Gérardin Conseil	Mr B. Gérardin	Bgerardin2@wanadoo.fr
PTV Planung Transport Verkehr AG	Mr M. Huschebeck	marcel.huschebeck@ptv.de
City of Groningen	Mrs M. Kramer	m.kramer@roez.groningen.nl
AICIA	Mr J. Larraneta	Astola@us.es
Area tráfico excmo ayuntamiento Malaga	Mrs M. Alonso Serrano	-
IVECO Institutional Relations & Transport	Mr A. Marchisio	marchisio@iveco.com
Transman	Mr J. Monigl	transman@transman.hu
PROINCA	Mr G. Montero	gmontero@proinca.com
University of Sevilla	Mr J. Munuzuri	Munuzuri@esi.us.es
Forum for City Logistics	Mr G. Petri	sekretaritet@forum-citylogistik.dk
NEA Transport Research and Training	Miss. S. Pop	spo@nea.nl
Polis	Mr J. Pourbaix	jpourbaix@polis-online.org
NEA Transport Research and Training	Mr M. Quispel	mqu@nea.nl
Rapp AG Ingenieure + Planer	Mr M. Ruesch	martin.ruesch@rapp.ch
Infomobility Spa	Mr L. Sardi	Lusard@tin.it
ACCESS - Eurocities for a New Mobility	Miss K. Vancluysen	k.vancluysen@eurocities.be
PTV Planung Transport Verkehr AG	Mr D. Wild	dieter.wild@ptv.de
VUD	Mr Zitnansky	-
ARRC	Mr T.H. Zunder	T.Zunder@sheffield.ac.uk

## AGENDA

### First day, 12th of September 2002, NH Hotel, Malaga, Spain

Chairman: Dieter Wild, PTV AG

#### **1. Welcome and introduction**

- 1a. Welcome and introduction by Dr Dieter Wild, PTV AG  
Structure and aims of the workshop
- 1b. Short self-introduction by each participant

#### **2. Approaches on PPP from different European Cities (I)**

- 2a. Presentation by Mrs M. Kramer, the City of Groningen and  
Mr F. Broersma, the Chamber of Commerce in Groningen,  
*"Public Private Partnerships in city logistics in the City of Groningen"*.
- 2b. Presentation by Mr L. Sardi, Infomobility Spa,  
*"Public Private Partnership in the City of Parma"*.

#### **3. Other approaches on PPP**

- 3a. Presentation by Mr R. Dorner, Econsult,  
*"Approaches on PPP in City and Regional Logistics in Austria"*.
- 3b. Presentation by Mrs Castellani, ISIS,  
*"The question of PPP in a logistic centre of a medium-sized industrial town: Terni (Italy)"*.
- 3c. Presentation by Mrs A. Marchisio, IVECO,  
*"PPP: enhancing the diffusion of EEV vehicles, an Italian experience"*.

#### **4. Approaches from Network view**

- 4a. Presentation by Mr R. van Bockel, PSD,  
*"PPP in the Netherlands"*.
- 4b. Presentation by Mr G. Petri, Forum for City Logistics,  
*"PPP in Denmark"*.

### AGENDA

#### Second day 13th of September 2002, NH Hotel, Malaga, Spain

Chairman: Dieter Wild, PTV AG

**5. Approaches from different European cities (II)**

5a. Presentation by Mr. B. Gérardin, Gérardin Conseil,  
*"PPP experiences from the French 'Marchandise en ville' program"*.

**6. Group discussion / round along the table**

All workshop participants (including also participants without presentation) are asked to actively participate and to prepare a very short statement on their view and expectations regarding PPP. E.g. to express the occurrence of special solutions, to highlight additional special problems, to recommend supporting or regulating policies or to address open questions which need to be answered, etc.

**7. Technical visit to the port of Malaga**

### DAY 1

#### Ad 1 “Welcome and introduction”

The chairman, Mr Wild, opens the 8th BESTUFS workshop and welcomes the participants. He describes the goals, the approach and the current status of Thematic Network BESTUFS. Furthermore he explains the focus of BESTUFS and of the current workshop. He announces that there are on average 3 workshops per year. There is a dedicated internet site for the Thematic Network BESTUFS where information about the previous and upcoming workshops and conferences is provided ([www.bestufs.net](http://www.bestufs.net)). The minutes and presentations which were held on these workshops can be found on this web site.

The subject of this 8th workshop is “Public Private Partnership (PPP) enhancing urban goods transport”. Presentations about this subject shall be held during the workshop. After the presentations a discussion is planned in order to get a clear vision on those aspects and issues where more attention should be paid to and where more effort is required. Mr Wild expresses the hope that the workshop will be interesting for each participant and invites the participants to bring forward issues which are considered useful for this workshop.

PPP is used for many different contacts, it’s not necessarily a contact where two parties come together. On one hand we have the city administration; who is responsible for the administration and the quality of live in the city. And on the other hand we have the retailers; they want to maximise their market. At the end of this workshop we have to understand the public and the pilot interest. We have to find a common solution.

A representative of the Municipality of Malaga gives a short welcome to the participants. She gives an introduction about the city of Malaga. Tomorrow in the afternoon a technical visit to the port of Malaga will take place. Furthermore she wishes the participants a fruitful workshop.

Next the participants introduce themselves and explain their role/interest in BESTUFS.

*You can download the handouts of the presentations which were held on this workshop and other annexes belonging to this minutes from [www.bestufs.net](http://www.bestufs.net) under page “workshops”, then click on “12-13 September 2002, Malaga” and on “downloads”.*

*In case you have problems with downloading, you can also contact the BESTUFS administration centre at [bestufs@nea.nl](mailto:bestufs@nea.nl) or call +31 70 3988 356]*

### Ad 2. Approaches on PPP from different European Cities (I)

- 2a. Presentation by Mrs M. Kramer from the City of Groningen and Mr F. Broersma from the Chamber of Commerce in Groningen,  
*"Public Private Partnerships in city logistics in the City of Groningen"*.

Mrs Kramer and Mr Broersma give a presentation about the City Centre Distribution of Groningen. In this presentation they bring forward a view of both sides of PPP. This presentation shows how in Groningen a city-centre distribution policy is introduced and how it has been developed.

Groningen is the 7<sup>th</sup> largest City in the Netherlands and has 175.000 habitants. Groningen has a strong local economy. Of the total employment, 60% can be found in service jobs: commercial and non-commercial. Interesting fact is that half of the people who work in this town, live outside the city itself.

In Groningen we want to seek a balance between accessibility and liveability. In 1994 a project started in Groningen to improve the liveability and to reduce the accessibility of certain areas for motorised vehicles. The measures agreed were: enlargement of pedestrian area, and introduction of time-windows for distribution in the car-free areas (between 5 and 11 AM and 6 and 8 PM). To improve accessibility for economic essential traffic, there has been an experiment with city centre distribution. Two distribution companies deliver goods from a distribution centre at the edge of city to the city centre, using small distribution vehicles. The local government gave permission to these so called recognised sustainable distribution companies to deliver also outside time-windows, to use bus-lanes and to cross section boundaries.

In conclusion both parties benefit: efficiency (distribution companies), economic vitality and liveability (city of Groningen). An "Advisory Commission for distribution issues", has been set up by the Council to supervise the experiment. This is the basis of the successful PPP in Groningen. The PPP of Groningen is based on making use of each other possibilities and knowledge. No financial commitment is involved.

In 1999 Groningen won the first price of a city distribution contest, offered by the National Platform City Distribution (PSD). They won the first price because of involvement of private parties in the project and the dare of the local administration to listen to arguments from private parties. Furthermore, the package of measures was seen as highly innovative.

Mrs Kramer and Mr Broersma conclude that there is still a lot that needs to be done on both sides to improve city logistics further, but there is also a lot possible.

#### *Questions/discussion*

Mrs Marchisio: How do you deal with the regulations for deliveries outside time windows?

Mrs Kramer: There are criteria for operators. The city administration has described the requirements. This is a legal settlement. Operators need to have a minimum of 100 deliveries within the city to be allowed to deliver also outside time-windows and to use bus-lanes and cross section boundaries.

- Mr Monigl: About the recognised sustainable distributors, is this a problem for the smaller companies?
- Mr Broersma: If operators make 100 or more deliveries then they are recognised as sustainable distributors. Companies with deliveries less than 100 per day are advised to cooperate with the recognised sustainable distributors. Goods can be bundled then, resulting in even more efficient distribution.
- Mrs Castellani: What about the price for the deliveries, how much do the operators charge?
- Mrs Kramer: The owners of the shop have no idea how much the deliveries of their goods cost. Certainly there is a difference in price of deliveries during the day or using the time-windows. But the receiving party can't choose for the way of distribution.
- Mr Petri: Are all the goods for the city-centre going via the Distribution Centres?
- Mrs Kramer: There are two Distribution Centres (operated by private transport enterprises). A lot of goods are brought to these two DC's but there are also direct deliveries by trucks in the City Centre. These trucks have to use the time-windows.
- Mr Dorner: Why did it take such a long time from 1977 till 1994 to find a solution?
- Mr Broersma: In the beginning it was a non-talking environment, there were disturbed relations and at the end of the eighties the political climate changed.
- Mr Chraibi: Can this experiment in Groningen be a general model for other cities?
- Mr Broersma: It depends, possibilities are diverse in modern cities. In relatively small city centres we can learn from each other. It's not possible to make a model for every city in the world. The main goal is to find a balance between accessibility and liveability.
- Mr Wild: The Advisory Commission is very important in this PPP, how does this work?
- Mr Broersma: There are 10-12 persons involved. In the experiment period we had meetings more often. Nowadays the Commission meets at least twice a year. The Advisory Commission is independent. This Commission advised the City Council.

2b. Presentation by Mr L. Sardi, Infomobility Spa,  
*"Public Private Partnership in the City of Parma"*.

The presentation deals with the Public Private Partnership enhancing urban goods transport. The municipality of Parma has approximately 170.000 inhabitants. The pilot test will concentrate on the town centre where 40% of deliveries are done with a density per km<sup>2</sup> of 7 times more than those recorded in peripheral areas. The city of Parma is a capital of food. Small shops are characteristic for the city centre.

The municipality has started a complex plan for intervention for Sustainable Mobility development. The main elements in this plan are:

- development of an infrastructural network,
- development and promotion of public transport,
- implementation of a co-ordinated mobility management plan,
- use of a new mobility integrating technologies,
- definition of a project for goods distribution.

There are two objectives that the goods distribution project wants to achieve. The first one is to increase the quality of air (low emission and environmental impact) and the second one is to reduce the traffic congestion by using city access regulations. The project is based on the organisation and implementation of transit points. A transit point is defined as a medium dimension logistic platform

where goods can be stored and selected. At the transit point the access permission is confirmed and slots for the access to the city centre can be booked.

The following steps are defined in the project:

1. Actualisation of research on goods distribution in Parma,
2. Preparation and communication of ordinances and rules on limitation of access,
3. Elaboration of types of passes at transit points,
4. Definition and development of software for management of goods distribution project.

The project starts October 2002 and is based on PPP in order to optimise goods distribution with respect to the environment.

### *Questions/remarks*

- Mr Wild: This was a very interesting presentation. You brought several issues to be dealt with forward in your presentation.
- Mr Broersma: How is the issue of 'responsibility' taken into account with respect to the transit point?
- Mr Sardi: It is private-private, just on a contractual basis. This will be no problem.
- Mr Dorner: What about the companies (big parcel operators) such as UPS, DHL etc.?
- Mr Sardi: This is no problem. They have the permission to go into the town. There is only a problem with the small operators and with own account transport. There is a possibility to enter the city for the delivery of goods, but this is only allowed during some hours of the day.
- Mr Huschebeck: Is the booking system for slots accessible for all operators?
- Mr Sardi: No, if you want to make a delivery in the restricted area you have to notify this.
- Mr Monigl: I liked the presentation, a good example. How about the costs of transport and using the transit point?
- Mr Sardi: The added value of the transit point is high, and it compensates extra transport costs. Retailers should pay for stock holding at transit point.
- Mr Van Bockel: Does this mean that the retailers are going to pay for the implementation of the transit point?
- Mr Sardi: No. Services as stock holding can be offered by transit point. The retailer will then be responsible for the stock at the transit point. Not the transport company. A good example of such a construction is the distribution of ice cream.
- Mr Wild: It was very interesting and I am curious on you experiences that you will get.

### **Ad 3. Other approaches on PPP**

- 3a. Presentation by Mr R. Dorner, Econsult,  
*"Approaches on PPP in City and Regional Logistics in Austria".*

Mr Dorner gives a presentation about the approaches on PPP in City and Regional Logistics in Austria. This presentation is based on the report of Mr P. Erlach the chairman and partner of Styria Log. In his presentation he brings forward the reasons and definitions of PPP, the European Pioneers of PPP, the Freight Village Cargo Center Graz and Styria Log. For the approach of PPP in logistics there has been developed a new Public Management initiated. This will consist of more services

performed by private enterprises and more co-operation between the private and the public sector. Furthermore Mr Dorner stresses that there are several important reasons for PPP. The tightening of public budgets has resulted in growing constraints on financing. Also the increasing acceptance of economic policy notions at several levels of the government is also a good reason for PPP. One can see that PPP is an extent to which co-operation is formalised. In Austria four different models of PPP are used. The facilities management model, development and management model, the licensing model, co-operation model. "STYRIA LOG" is a Austrian example of PPP. This is a logistic platform formed by logistic providers and supported by the province Styria in connection with the freight village Cargo Center Graz.

The objective of Styria Log is bundling of goods for better usage of capacities in combination with the reduction of transaction costs are. Besides this important is to reduce the number of lorries on the roads, which will improve the environmental situation.

Important for the success of PPP is the use of independent consultation services. Furthermore, clearly defined objectives on the part of the involved public bodies and precise definition of the different areas of responsibility of the partners are crucial elements. The submission of a business plan and checking of the financial position of private partners are also important for the sustainability of PPP. Also an exit strategy has to be defined in case a partner ceases to meet the obligations made within the terms of the partnership.

### *Questions / remarks*

- Mr Van Bockel: I do not see any public partners participating in Styrialog, are they only providing money?
- Mr Dorner: The province of Styria was the initiator of the project. Their further role was to provide funds for the project.
- Mr Van Bockel: Private parties together in a project looks like a cartel. How to deal with this?
- Mr Dorner: Many countries are thinking about the rules for PPP.

### 3b. Presentation by Mrs Castellani, ISIS, *"The question of PPP in a logistic centre of a medium-sized industrial town: Terni (Italy)"*

Mrs Castellani gives a presentation about PPP in a logistic centre of a medium-sized industrial town. Generally, commercial and administrative activities are located in the centre of European cities and towns, while industrial activities are located in their surroundings. This will result in a growth of multiple flows of traffic, due to both passengers and goods transport. As a consequence, congested traffic conditions can occur along different paths and directions. The problems derived from transport; pollution, congestion, accidents and noise need some solution as soon as possible. Because of the higher density of the population, in the urban systems such solution is more urgent than elsewhere.

Three main kind of solutions are generally taken into consideration, mainly for urban transport:

-Some schemes of road charging

-R&D of 'clean' technologies

-Investment for infrastructure (they need a consistent land planning e.g. a logistic platform)

The project for the intermodal and logistic centre was funded by EU and national government through the PRUSST Programme. The total cost of the building amount to about € 12 million and will be

supported 50% by public and 50% by the local industrial and transport firms. The regional government will hold a share in the joint (public-private) company that is intended to manage the centre, at least for a certain period.

### Questions / remarks

Mrs Dablanc: Are most of the existing logistic platforms private ones?

Mrs Castellani: The logistic platform is private. "Interporto" is for intermodal transport. These are complementary. There is a strong connection between intermodal port and the logistic platform (25 km).

- 3c. Presentation by Mrs A. Marchisio, IVECO,  
*"PPP: enhancing the diffusion of EEV vehicles, an Italian experience"*.

Mrs Marchisio starts her presentation by highlighting the history of CNG vehicles within the FIAT-IVECO company. Mrs Marchisio illustrates that CNG is an ancient technology that started in the mid twenties the late thirties. IVECO was founded in 1975. The reason why IVECO promotes CNG is because CNG is an ecological fuel. It produces neither PM nor Benzene. Furthermore, engines running on CNG produce less CO<sub>2</sub> compared to engines running on gasoline and diesel. Also the fuel life cycle has little environmental impact. Moreover engines running on CNG produce less noise and CNG is a safe fuel. Another positive aspect is that CNG is a real alternative to oil derived fuels. Because of the low purchasing costs of CNG vehicles compared to electric/hybrid vehicles and vehicles with fuel cells, it offers also a realistic and feasible solution for the short term. There are already good practices with operational vehicles running on CNG in a real market environment.

Calculations have been made with scenario's in which CNG is used for light commercial vehicles, buses and taxi's. The output shows that a big reduction of emissions can be reached with CNG. Even the comparison with Euro 3 vehicles shows results in favour of CNG.

A three-party agreement has been made between the FIAT group, the Italian Oil Union and the Italian Ministry of Environment. The objective of the agreement is to promote and enhance the diffusion of CNG for automotive traction in big metropolitan areas and particularly in those cities where the concentration levels of PM<sub>10</sub> are critical. The oil company will provides the CNG distribution network. FIAT group has committed itself to supply a new series of CNG vehicles in the years 2002-2004. The Ministry of Environment will simplify bureaucratic procedures and will determine new economic incentives in order to promote purchasing of CNG vehicles. Furthermore, the Ministry of Environment gives financial support to the realisation of the CNG distribution network and provides financial support for the renewal of public and private bus parks and waste collection vehicles. Total investment of the three parties amounts €553 million.

Mrs Marchisio concludes that public private partnerships (PPP) offer great advantages for all stakeholders including the general public. Furthermore, PPP will become a common practice in Europe. PPP represents a concrete way of co-operation among governments, public administrations, enterprises and non governmental organisations (NGO's) creating a dialogue between different parties and reaching consensus for the whole community.



### Questions / remarks

- Mr Chraibi: With respect to safety aspects of distribution vehicles. How about the position of the driver? Is it better to have a low cabin or a high cabin?
- Mrs Marchisio: Sorry, I don't know. I am not an engineer.
- Mr Dorner: How much more expensive is CNG compared to a regular EURO-3 truck running on diesel?
- Mrs Marchisio: 15-18%.
- Mr Zunder: Is it also possible to refurbish old Diesel vehicles by means of converting them to CNG?
- Mrs Marchisio: Yes, this is actually cheaper than purchasing a new vehicle. Part of the funds provided by the Ministry are reserved for these activities.
- Mr Van Bockel: Did you make a comparison between CNG and Euro-5? In the Netherlands this comparison was made and the conclusion was that there is no difference.
- Mrs Marchisio: Yes, we made the comparison and there is indeed no difference. However, CNG has nothing to do with oil so this is a positive aspect. Furthermore it is well possible that technologies will co-exist. The political situation or influence is very important with respect to this subject.
- Mr Wild: What is the duration of the programme?
- Mrs Marchisio: The year of expiry is 2005. The intention of the government is to prolong the co-operation, it is a plan for longer term. CNG is available. In 1996 they started already with experiments with CNG.
- Mr Zunder: What can you save with a truck running on CNG. How much cheaper is it to use CNG instead of traditional fuels?
- Mrs Marchisio: One can save more or less 50% on the fuel costs in case there is no heavy tax on CNG as exists for diesel. The reduction of fuel costs strongly depends on the level of the fuel taxes. Building a distribution network for CNG distribution is now the first important step.
- Mr Wild: Fiscal schemes and duties are important, especially because these differ per country.

### **Ad4. Approaches from Network view**

- 4a. Presentation by Mr R. van Bockel, PSD,  
*"PPP in the Netherlands".*

Mr Van Bockel starts the presentation by giving an overview of the problems and opportunities in urban freight transport in The Netherlands. PSD (Forum for urban goods freight transport) has the goals to improve accessibility of cities, enhance cities' living environment, increase transport efficiency and retain/ improve the economic situation in (inner)cities. PSD operates from synergy between the government and a range of business organisations. It functions as a discussion body, facilitator, communicator, project manager, knowledge body for industry and public authorities. PSD started in 1995 with orientation and from 1998 it is focussing on confrontation. PSD has projects, working groups, a steering group, secretariat, regional taskforces, sounding group and has interactive products and (communication) products. PSD also hosts several web sites. There are two active

stakeholder groups involved, these are the companies on the one side and public authorities on the other side. Three inactive stakeholder groups that are becoming involved are the politicians, citizens and knowledge institutes.

PSD has realised a strategic change in the approach of urban freight transport being: co-operation between parties in dealing with the urban freight transport problem. The vision of PSD is that 24-hours delivery should be enabled within the framework of sustainable development. Parties in PSD work together for the required uniformity and innovation based on a public basis. They are convinced that the total costs are less than total costs of single minded actions.

Mr Van Bockel shows the status of implementation of PSD products. Some cities in The Netherlands are innovative, while others are behind and don't have a uniform regime yet. The challenge of the PSD is to become just an element of the network of parties and organisations, and not to become a power centre. The recommendations Mr Van Bockel makes is that the PPP network should be transparent and that has an identity that is easy to recognise. Furthermore it should improve the acting capacity of the participants, provide general solutions, enables tailor made activities, keeps secrecy into certain extent, connects networks, provides value for money, has quality control, is able to grow and answers promptly. Furthermore he stresses that it all depends on human interaction. Motivation of people involved is therefore the spill.

### *Questions / remarks*

- Mrs Castellani: Have you ever dealt with international managers, multi-national companies?  
These parties often are not interested.
- Mr Van Bockel: Involvement of such parties is arranged via the intermediary organisations, they are members. Together with the intermediary organisations the products are developed and established.
- Mrs Dablang: On the website of PSD one can find information about each city on their access regulations that is often different per city. Is this information used?
- Mr Van Bockel: This database on local regulations and facilities is one of the best products of PSD. The input from municipalities was however hard to get. Transport operators use this information to get a general view on the local conditions and requirements for delivery.
- Mr Huschebeck: The fact that all relevant parties are represented is a strength and very valuable. What is the main output of PSD?
- Mr Van Bockel: Different statements are made by the PSD. In general PSD is not determining what the government has to do. There is always discussion between PSD and the other party. It is always a matter of balancing between the stakes and interests of the various parties involved.
- Mrs Marchisio: The good thing about this approach is that it isn't a threat to society. PSD isn't doing this work for your own profit. PSD is trying to put people together with different interests and then trying to get the best out of it.
- Mr Wild: Perhaps BESTUFS can then also be seen as PPP and is well comparable with PSD, although PSD is more a national network.
- Mr Van Bockel: PSD makes recommendations and gives advice to both the industry as well as to policymakers based on the expertise and experience of the various parties involved and working together. Citizens are also involved in the PSD in a indirect

way. It's important that the general public is aware of the necessity of freight transport, it's necessary for the variety and quality of the goods they can purchase. There is still a perception problem of the public with respect to freight transport.

4b. Presentation by Mr G. Petri, Forum for City Logistics,  
*"PPP in Denmark"*.

Mr Gorm Petri gives a presentation about the forum for City Logistics in Denmark. The forum for City Logistics is co-operation between the cities Copenhagen, Aalborg and Aarhus. The Danish Ministry of Transport is a partner and sponsor of this project, which was established in April 2001. The main objectives of the Danish forum for City Logistics are:

- to create transport solutions to the benefit of the city environment,
- to co-ordinate projects in the three cities in order to ensure consistency
- to collect and share information about projects in Denmark and abroad,
- to provide other municipalities advice and guidance,
- to establish networks within the city logistics area.

Public partners in the Forum are: The Ministry of Transport, The Ministry of Environment, The Ministry of Justice and the municipalities. Private parties are: The transport industry and organisations, the retail trade / shopkeepers, the shippers.

There are several Danish PPP projects. For instance the project in the City of Aalborg. Four types of partners are involved in this project; The four largest transport companies, the commercial council, the police and the Municipality of Aalborg. The most important elements of the trial are; transport co-ordination, one shop as joint receiver, the change of the driving direction in a one-way street, establishing passing/ unloading areas, backdoor delivery, considerate driving and two employees at each vehicle.

In Aarhus city a project started with the environmental zone scheme. The plan was to introduce an obligatory environmental zone ordinance for the city's pedestrian streets in which vehicles over 6 tonnes total weight are prohibited. The aim is to reduce noise and emission and to enhance the aesthetics of the area and to minimise the impact and damage on the streets' foundations.

Furthermore in Copenhagen a certification scheme is established on trial. There is a Green-, Yellow- and Red certificate. One of these certificates is required to enter the town. The green certificate is based on the following rules: The average loading capacity must be 60% (over 3 months), engines must be younger than 8 years, utilisation of loading capacity must be reported to the municipality every 3 months. The green certificate gives the right to use loading zones and is valid for the whole trial period. Costs are 43 Euro. The yellow certificate is meant for dispensation for those who cannot meet the restrictions for the green certificate. Costs are 43 Euro and the yellow certificate is valid for 6 months. The red certificate is an option for those who rarely drives in the inner city and is valid for one day only. There are no restrictions and it can be bought at approximately 25 petrol stations on streets leading to the designated area at a price of 6.6 Euro.

In Odense city there a large-scale test was performed of particle filters. The objectives of this project are to evaluate different filter types, collect operating experiences, evaluate environmental results, demonstrate the utilisation of filters, disseminate experience from the project and to obtain cleaner air in Odense.

A number of success factors are mentioned by Mr Petri for the operation of the PPP (city logistics Forum). These are: to have common set of values, uniform political signals and attitude, a clear decision-making process, stick to decisions, knowledge and understanding of transport chains, strong inter-personal relations, create confidence, enable positive competition, develop reasonable and sustainable solutions, take responsibility, support knowledge enhancement and remember the human dimension.

### *Questions / remarks*

- Mr Wild: You mentioned an example for the back-door delivery of goods. How did this initiative arise?
- Mr Petri: By involved technician, looking for a solution for back-door delivery.
- Mr Munuzuri: About the certification scheme in Copenhagen, how long is that running?
- Mr Petri: The pilot started in February 2002 and will be running till November 2003.
- Mr Munuzuri: How many trucks are registered and how many for one day?
- Mr Petri: The registration goes via petrol stations, we do not know the share.
- Mr Munuzuri: How do you control the requirement that trucks need to have a load factor of 60 percent?
- Mr Petri: The transport operator has to report the load for each trip.
- Mrs Kramer: Was there the need for new legislation with respect to the certificates that are needed (red, green and yellow) and are they otherwise not allowed to stop in the city? Is this certification scheme obliged?
- Mr Petri: Yes, new legislation was introduced. Without a certificate the truck driver is not allowed to stop and make a delivery in the city. However, the truck drivers do not need the certificate to drive through the city.
- Mrs Marchisio: What is the big advantage of the green certificate?
- Mr Petri: The green certificate is a licence for the whole period of the pilot, unless rules are broken of in case of fraud.
- Mr Van Bockel: Where can these certificates be bought?
- Mr Petri: The red certificates you can be purchased at the petrol stations. The green and yellow can be obtained at administration services in the city.
- Mrs Marchisio: Are there distribution centres around Copenhagen? If there are, are these an option for the truck driver that don't have the certificate?
- Mr Petri: Yes, there are several distribution centres in Copenhagen, divided per type of goods. If these DC's are an option for the truck driver, this depends on his agreement with the receiver of the goods.
- Mrs Kramer: How did you communicate this legislation and approach?
- Mr Petri: We use the following means of communication: a web site, a newsletter and we give direct information to transport companies.
- Mrs Marchisio: How was the acceptance of the measure?

- Mr Petri: There were no problems in the whole transport business, everybody is in favour of the scheme.
- Mr Monigl: Didn't you have legislative problems with the EU legislation, or with the Danish legislation?
- Mr Petri: There were no problems with EU legislation. However, there were some problems with the Danish legislation, but these problems could be overcome and now the public authorities clearly see the advantages of the project. The scheme is only in operation in a small area of Copenhagen. This doesn't give problems for the through-going traffic.
- Mr Wild: Copenhagen was also addressed in the 2<sup>nd</sup> BESUFS workshop. More information you will find on [www.besufs.net](http://www.besufs.net).

### DAY 2

The chairman, Mr Wild, re-opens the workshop and welcomes the participants. He gives a short summary of the previous day.

#### **Ad5. Approaches from different European cities (II)**

- 5a. Presentation by Mr. B. Gérardin, Gérardin Conseil,  
*"PPP experiences from the French 'Marchandise en ville' program"*.

Mr Gérardin gives a presentation called "PPP enhancing urban goods transports". The presentation deals specifically with the PPP experiences of the French "Marchandise en Ville" programme and goes into the PPP experiences in city logistics in France. Besides this he presents the case study of La Rochelle<sup>1</sup>.

The national Government has decided to launch a long term action programme to improve urban freight transport. This programme is managed by the French ministry of Transport and the French Agency for Environment and Energy Savings. This Program has three fold aim:

- to establish a comprehensive data base upon the different aspects of urban freight and disseminate the accumulated knowledge to the local decision makers.
- to develop enquires and to appraise the impacts of actions not only on transport but also on the local economy and on the environment.
- to promote and estimate experiences in juridical, technical and economical fields, in tight co-operation with local authorities.

When one takes a look at the PPP experiences in city logistics in France, five key sectors for action can be identified:

1. new organisation of supply chains,
2. new urban organisations,
3. new regulations, better fitted to urban freight transport,
4. development of co-operation between cities in a same urban area,
5. development of new technologies.

About 30 projects are in preparation or ongoing with the financial support of the French National "Marchandises en Ville" program. Mr Gérardin presents in short all the projects. The projects deal with Urban Distribution Centres, Business to Consumer distribution systems, regulations and information technology. A lot of feasibility studies with conclusions and strategic information were the result of the ongoing projects. The key question of the projects is the economic viability of the projects in a medium/long term perspective. And on average the necessity of a long period of consultation with the actors is minimum a year. Furthermore Mr Gérardin remarks that there is a lack of legal framework

for innovative projects. Besides this, one of the conclusions is that there is a strong interest from the chambers of commerce and the transport operators in these projects. Public actors can't regulate this sector without consultation and partnership with private actors. Consultation and co-operation with the actors concerned by applied and experimental projects is an efficient way to contribute to the optimisation of urban freight transport. The most promising way is to follow a step-by-step procedure at the local level.

### *Questions / remarks*

- Mr Broersma: Can you provide more details about the PAD project?
- Mr Gérardin: The PAD project is focussed on the home delivery of products. It is free for consumers and it is paid by the shops and is financially supported by the social programme for unemployed young people. The project started in 1997 and the duration will be till 2002. Now the project is stopped due to cancellation of financial supports. We also received support from private parties, e.g. Peugeot. Long term feasibility is not yet proved.
- Mr Dorner: Do the customers actually use the home delivery service?
- Mr Gérardin: Yes, although the number of customers is limited. It depends on the project and the location of the project.
- Mrs Dablanç: In Paris we had a test area, where 50 deliveries per day were done.
- Mrs Chraïbi: Do you have more information on the other projects? The problems and so on?
- Mr Gérardin: You have to face and study the problems, before you can solve them. France is not the only country who faces problems with urban freight transport. In general the results of the projects are positive. In France we were successful in some projects. We made big progress in the last 10 years. We solve the problems by means of a step-by-step approach. Now there is more communication between city authorities and the private side, so more knowledge is available and accessible. We have established a good climate for co-operation.
- Mrs Dablanç: On the following web sites you can find more information in French:  
-[www.transports-marchandises-en-ville.org](http://www.transports-marchandises-en-ville.org)  
-[www.gart.org](http://www.gart.org)

---

<sup>1</sup> see BESTUFS workshop 7 proceedings for detailed information about the project in La Rochelle.

### Ad6. Group discussion / round along the table

- Mrs Marchisio: It is very important to involve all parties. There are two important aspects regarding Public Private Partnerships. It is important to bring the parties together, to provide incentives and then one can see if a solution can be found. As we saw yesterday with respect to the CNG project we need approximately a 4-year period of experiments etc. So it will take a long time before we will find a solution.
- Mr Zunder: PPP is existing already for a long time. It is regulation through consent. The authority has the possibility to change something. There are three different types of PPP: contractual, regulatory and voluntary.
- Mr Wild: PPP is something additional. PPP is an addition to the existing political system for decision making and determining the rules.
- Mr Van Bockel: The basis of PPP is that there is a problem that needs to be solved. PPP is creating an infrastructure to develop innovative solutions. Logistic is geographically unlimited but the authorities are geographical bounded. If there wouldn't be any problems, PPP wouldn't exist. However, the problems are increasing at the moment, so the need for PPP will increase.
- Mr Petri: PPP is the only solution to the problems. It's important that the parties work together, because nobody can solve the problems by themselves (at least not in Denmark).
- Mrs Castellani: It's a common problem of democracy. Also a problem of the kind of goods and trucks. When it concerns infrastructure, private parties need PPP to optimise infrastructure. PPP is efficient, due to efficiency of the private sector and because of more funds available for investments.
- Mrs Dablanc: Freight transport is not decided on at a local level. It is a problem to find and involve the real decision makers (shippers, retailing chains, etc). There are decision makers on the private side that operate on a European level. There is a big difference with passenger transport, because then all decisions are made by local authorities.
- Mr Petri: Also the public sector needs to be clear about existing restrictions and regulations towards the freight transport operators.
- Mr Wild: Both sides have their own problems. However, they should overcome these problems and make create win-win situations and make the PPP successful.
- Mr Monigl: PPP exists also on a regional base; e.g. in fair public transport. With respect to freight transport, also costs should be individualised and should take the external cost in account.
- Mr Wild: The reduction of externalities is the driving factor for the public parties to work on the urban freight transport problems.
- Mr Van Bockel: We are just at the start of a co-operation and the next step is implementation. Implementation will cost a lot of money. Now in the Netherlands we are in the first phase and talking about co-operation a lot. However, we want to implement at the same time with the lowest price. An important and critical issue is therefore the financial commitment of the parties involved in the PPP.
- Mrs VanCluysen: I found this a very interesting workshop. PPP is a powerful instrument. Actors should share the responsibility and they have to make a combination of commercial and social interest. A partnership has to be beneficial for the two

parties on the long term. A part of the next ACCESS conference is focussed on Urban freight transport.

Mr Pourbaix: Crucial for PPP is the financing aspect. And there are still questions about sustainability of solutions.

Mr Huschebeck: It's important to balance between the interests of user groups (citizens, operators, municipalities, service providers etc.). PPP is a way to reach specific goals and to find solutions for some problems. Regional solutions are relevant, but this results in different solutions for access regulations in the cities. This can be problematic e.g. for transport operators that operate on a larger geographic scale.

Mr Ruesch: PPP will become more important in the future, because more problems will arise and because of this there is a larger need for traffic management. The same goes for transshipment and logistic platforms.

Mr Wild: Thank you all for your participation to this workshop. I hope this was a fruitful workshop to all of you. The next workshop will take place on 23rd and 24th of January 2003. This 9th BESTUFS workshop will be held in Budapest, Hungary and treating the theme: "Night delivery: a further option in urban distribution". Next year there will be a conference in Madeira. This will be a scientific city logistic conference. Information can be found on the BESTUFS web site.

### **8. Technical visit to the port of Malaga**

The port of Malaga is visited. One can see how the processes in the port is going and what kind of equipment is used. Furthermore the plans to enlarge the port of Malaga are presented.